



# **Table of Contents**

I. Fo	preword	3
II. A	acknowledgement	5
III. V	What is an Election Manifesto and Why is it Necessary to Analyses it?	6
IV.	Analysing the complaints registered with the Manifesto points	7
	le 1: Major subject points from the manifestos and deliberations on each subject from April 201 rch 2021	7 to 7
Tab	le 2: Civic complaints registered in Delhi from 2017-18 to 2020-21	8
	le 3: The complaints related to the manifesto and issues raised by the political party councillors m April 2017 to March 2021	9
Tab	le 4: Issue-wise average number of issues raised by 1 councillor from April 2017 to March 2021	10
٧.	A case study on major Civic Manifesto points with Deliberations	11
A.	Toilet Services in Delhi	11
Tab	le 5: Toilet Services related manifesto points and the status	11
В.	Drainage System	12
Tab	le 6: Drainage related manifesto points and the status	12
C.	Solid Waste Management	12
Tab	le 7: SWM related manifesto points and the status	12
VI.	Annexure	14
A.	All-Party manifesto links from 2017 MCD elections	14



### I. Foreword

In February 2022, the national budget proposed large investments to boost urban development and infrastructure in the country. As more and more cities emerge, it is evident they are driving forces for economic growth. Citizens migrate from rural to urban spaces with the desire to improve their source of incomes and in turn their standard of living. However, cities too must contribute to create better livelihoods by efficiently providing basic and important services to its citizens. Civic wants and needs, such as adequate water supply, affordable housing, cleanliness, good roads and pavements, dedicated bus routes, drains covered and maintained, affordable quality public education and healthcare etc. should be addressed by local governments, that is, municipal corporations and councils.

Municipal corporations constitute the administrative wing and elected wing. The residents of a city get an opportunity to elect their representatives, once every 5 years. These elected representatives, in turn, represent the citizens' issues to the administration. Before elections, the political parties develop manifestos which outlines the objectives of the party and their candidates, based on which citizens elect their representatives. The manifesto, among other things, includes action plans and promises to provide civic wants and needs as well as solve various service delivery related issues that citizens face on a regular basis.

With Municipal Corporation of Delhi (MCD) elections due, political parties and their candidates will declare their commitments for the upcoming tenure. However, at this juncture, it is also important to look back at the promises made by them in the last MCD elections for the current term (F.Y. 2017-2022), and to analyse their performance based on the fulfilment of the same. Praja has, thus, come up with an analysis of manifesto promises of major political parties (BJP, AAP and INC) and compared them with their overall deliberations, and citizens' complaints related to those manifesto points. Based on this analysis, Praja is also sharing recommendations of targets to be set for upcoming MCD elections and providing a goal so that elected councillors can work towards achieving the same. Additionally, global and international targets have been recommended so that political parties can include them in the new manifesto. This is aimed towards bettering the quality of the upcoming manifestos and therefore, in the long run, improving deliberations and thus the quality of life of citizens.

Of the overall deliberations in the period F.Y. 2017-18 to F.Y. 2020-21, 72% were related to promises made by the major political parties in their manifestos. While tracking the complaints and deliberations, it was discovered that some of the major complaints have not been successfully resolved. For example, one of the highest numbers of civic complaints were registered under solid waste management (SWM - 1,07,312 complaints) from F.Y. 2017-18 to F.Y. 2020-21. Furthermore, in the last manifestos, the major political parties had promised improvement in SWM with better collection of garbage. Maximum of the issues were raised by MCD councillors on SWM in this period (14% - 9,157 out of 63,821), however, these issues have not been resolved. This could signify that despite deliberations, effective interventions for SWM have not been implemented on ground in the city.

The report also showcases various case studies, on deliberations related to sanitation services like toilets, drainage and SWM. BJP in their manifesto had promised more world class toilets with adequate facilities in Delhi. However, in Praja's report on civic issues in Delhi 2021, there was a 17% disparity in the MCD community toilet seats for women. More so, in 16% of MCD public and community toilets, there was no water connection available while 10% of them had no electricity. However, the overall proportion of issues raised by BJP on the same was only 2%. As another example, AAP had promised complete cleaning of drains in the city and INC promised to create a modern drainage system. However, out of the total 34,169 drainage complaints registered in 2020, 83% of these complaints were on drainage chokes, blockages & cleaning and overflowing manholes. The number of issues raised by AAP and INC on drainage stood at only 2% (for both parties) of total deliberations from F.Y. 2017-18 to F.Y. 2020-21.



The disparity of complaints and questions asked by councillors go on to reiterate the importance of deliberation of citizen specific issues. It is also important to look at the SDG goals and other global and national targets for various issues, and work towards achieving them. These are important targets to achieve as these directly impact the quality of life of citizens and MCD needs to focus on the same. Political parties should study these targets and ensure that the manifestos align to achieving these targets by creating programmes around the same. The disparity of complaints and questions asked by councillors go on to reiterate the importance of deliberation of citizen specific issues. It is also important to look at the SDG goals and other global and national targets for various issues, and work towards achieving them. These are important targets to achieve as these directly impact the quality of life of citizens and MCD needs to focus on the same. Political parties should study these targets and ensure that the manifestos align to achieving these targets by creating programmes around the same.

Praja also believes that for better citizen centric service delivery, the manifesto should incorporate reforms for efficient urban governance and create real and quantifiable targets to achieve. Successful cities all over the world are governed and managed by empowered leaders, elected by the citizens. Praja has long been advocating for the empowerment of the city government with the devolution of the 18 functions under the 74th Constitutional Amendment Act (CAA). It is necessary to empower elected representatives, especially the mayor, to have authority over the city government and to put forth mechanisms that also hold them accountable.

The complicated and overlapping agencies in Delhi's governance and service delivery brings about issues in providing these services efficiently to the citizens. It is important that a city should have a single authority when it comes to providing basic services as listed under the 74th CAA. Human resources in the service delivery ecosystem also need to be appropriately trained to ensure smooth functioning of cities. Promoting citizen participation with effective feedback/suggestion mechanisms to track the needs and wants of the citizens will also allow for improvement in service delivery. Political parties, along with the administration must identify, understand and implement achievable targets in their manifesto with reference to global and national targets in order to enable effective governance and better quality of life for citizens.

NITAI MEHTA Founder Trustee, Praja Foundation



## II. Acknowledgement

Praja has obtained the data used in compiling this white paper through the Right to Information Act, 2005. Hence it is very important to acknowledge the RTI Act and everyone involved, especially the officials who have provided us with this information diligently.

We would like to appreciate our stakeholders; particularly, our Elected Representatives & government officials, the Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) and the journalists who utilise and publicise our data and, by doing so, ensure that awareness regarding various issues that we discuss is distributed to a wide-ranging population. We would like to take this opportunity to specifically extend our gratitude to all government officials for their continuous cooperation and support.

Praja Foundation appreciates the support given by our supporters and donors, namely Friedrich Naumann Foundation, Madhu Mehta Foundation, IC Centre for Governance (ICCfG) and numerous other individual supporters. Their support has made it possible for us to conduct our study & publish this white paper.

We would also like to thank our group of Advisors & Trustees and lastly but not the least, we would like to acknowledge the contributions of all members of Praja's team as well as Interns, who worked to make this white paper a reality.







## III. What is an Election Manifesto and Why is it Necessary to Analyses it?

Every city is unique and the issues that a city and its citizens face are also unique. Delhi is the capital city, a city where a citizen's civic wants and needs include adequate water supply, adequate and good housing, cleanliness, good roads and pavements, dedicated bus routes, drains covered and maintained, affordable quality education and healthcare for the poor, etc. Citizens also wish for improvement in areas that can enhance the standard of living in the city such as clean and green open areas, reduction in pollution, better recreational spaces, participation in civic forums, etc. An ideal manifesto is when these aspirations of the city are prioritised by the elected representatives, with a promise to work to ensure all these needs are fulfilled in a time.

An election manifesto is created by a political party and it specifies the various ideologies and commitments the party aims to make to the citizens of a city. The manifesto is usually in the form of a booklet that is issued to the citizens and has the following uses:

- (i) At the time of elections, it enables voters to know about the policies/ programmes and services the party aims to implement, so they can make an informed choice on the candidate.
- (ii) It allows citizens to know the status of implementation of various policies and programmes included in the election manifestoes.

## Is it necessary to analyse the election manifesto?

The answer is YES! There is a need to assess the commitments promised in an election manifesto as it shows if measures are taken to ensure they worked to fulfil their promises. Additionally, it adds knowledge for citizens, when they decide to vote for their ideal representative.

Praja has long been advocating for the elected representatives to effectively utilise their deliberative duties to solve major issues existing in Delhi. Thus, through this paper, Praja aims to provide a brief analysis of the commitments made and the deliberations that have been carried out by major political parties. Additionally, data on issues with most complaints registered by citizens from 2017-18 to 2020-21 have been included. Thus, this will showcase areas where there is a need for effective improvement and hence, soon all political parties can incorporate them in their commitments to the citizens.

In our analysis, we have compared promises in the political party's manifestos' from the 2017 MCD elections and issues raised by respective party councillors from April 2017 to March 2021.



## IV. Analysing the complaints registered with the Manifesto points

The most objective way of analysing the manifesto is comparing promises with issues raised by councillors in various committees. However, not all parties have necessarily issues raised exactly related to categories mentioned in the manifesto. Thus, to simplify, we have compared issues raised in preceding years which are closely relevant to categories mentioned in all manifestos.

In our analysis, we have compared issues in political party manifestos for the 2017 MCD elections and issues raised by respective party councillors from April 2017 to March 2021. We have given the benefit of doubt to political parties while comparing issues mentioned in the manifestos with issues raised. For example, if constructing toilets at auto and taxi stands was listed as a point in the manifesto, issues raised on sanitation were taken as being related to this issue. This is because although constructing toilets at auto and taxi stands is a specific issue; it is linked to the broader topic of sanitation

Complaints registered by citizens from 2017 to 2021 have also been considered to understand the latest status of services in the manifesto. The manifesto points that are loosely connected to the registered complaints have been analysed to see the overall status of deliberation and to map the required areas for improvement in the city. The information from the 3 MCD corporations have been considered, i.e. NDMC, EDMC and SDMC. New Delhi Municipal Council and Delhi Cant. has not been considered in this analysis.

Table 1: Major subject points from the manifestos and deliberations on each subject from April 2017 to March 2021

Manifesta Dainta	ВЈР	AAP	INC
Manifesto Points	(182 Councillors)	(55 Councillors)	(28 Councillors)
Animal welfare/Stray animals	827	185	163
Budget	550	91	91
Buildings & Housing	1,495	444	359
Corruption	5	3	2
Environment/pollution	58	5	15
Fire Safety Related	2	1	0
Garden/open spaces	2,920	644	514
Licensing and Hawking	5,110	1,109	850
Municipal School Education	3,596	728	571
Pest Control	192	40	37
Public Health	2,115	444	286
Resident Welfare Associations & Citizen Participation	35	1	1
Roads & Transport	2,698	611	579
Sanitation	888	194	193
Sewerage/Drainage	773	218	122
Slum Development	52	13	10
Solid Waste Management (SWM)	6,466	1,685	1,006
Taxes	2,798	419	411
Traffic & Parking	1,382	285	210
Women, children, youth & Welfare of youth / Senior			
citizens	927	190	207
Total Issues Raised related only to Manifesto Points	32,889	7,310	5,627
Issues Raised not related to the manifesto	13,523	2,380	2,092
Total Issues Raised	46,412	9,690	7,719

**Note:** The cells in grey represent that it was not mentioned in the respective manifesto.



#### Inferences

- BJP councillors, in their deliberation, raised a higher number of civic issues like SWM (6,466), licensing (5,110), municipal education (3,596), open spaces (2,920), healthcare (2,115), roads (2,698) and taxation (2,798). In comparison, issues raised on sanitation (888), slum development (52) & pollution (58) are much lower in numbers.
- AAP councillors raised maximum issues on SWM (1,685), licencing (1,109), municipal education (728) open spaces (644) & roads (611). Issues raised on sanitation (194), slum development (13) & pollution (5) are very low in numbers.
- INC councillors had a higher number of deliberations for civic issues like SWM (1,006), licensing (850), roads (579), municipal education (571), open spaces (514) & healthcare (286), while issues raised on slum development was only 10 issues raised.
- Pollution has been a rising issue in Delhi. Despite promises to improve the pollution in the city, deliberations by MCD councillors on this issues is low in comparison. (BJP – 58, AAP – 5, INC – 15)

Table 2: Civic complaints registered in Delhi from 2017-18 to 2020-21

Complaints	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20	2020-21
Building	55,802	68,176	55,536	46,039
Solid Waste Management	27,792	27,845	23,996	27,679
Nuisance due to stray dogs, monkeys, etc.	22,303	21,534	16,958	10,140
Drainage	10,910	10,410	7,371	5,055
Pest control	5,881	4,677	3,854	7,031
Garden	4,428	5,039	4,038	4,106
License	5,028	5,045	4,355	2,718
Roads	3,329	3,705	2,911	1,521
Storm Water Drainage	2,105	2,285	1,387	941
Municipal Corporation of Delhi	867	681	424	269
Disaster Management	951	685	284	99
Sanitation	395	424	480	212
Pollution	218	257	215	79
Water Supply	233	174	142	106
Footpaths	15	22	16	3
Others Civic Issue Related	1,353	1,041	955	607
Total	1,41,610	1,52,000	1,22,922	1,06,605

#### Inferences:

- Maximum numbers of complaints made in MCD are related to buildings (46,039), solid waste management (27,679) and nuisance due to stray dogs and monkeys (10,140) in 2020-21.
- The registered complaints have declined in most of the issues, but there is an increase in complaints related to basic civic services such as pest control (82%) and solid waste management (15%) from 2019-20 to 2020-21.
- From 2017-18 to 2020-21, complaints related to SWM have almost remained constant from 27,792 in 2017-18 to 27,679 in 2020-21. Similarly, complaints related to gardens were 4,428 in 2017-18 to 4,106 in 2020-21.



Table 3: The complaints related to the manifesto and issues raised by the political party councillors from April 2017 to March 2021

	Number of	Deliberations Raised Related to the Manifesto			
The complaint related to	Complaints	ВЈР	AAP	INC	
Manifesto	(2017-18 to 2020-21)	(182 Councillors)	(55 Councillors)	(28 Councillors)	
Buildings	2,25,553	3%	5%	5%	
Solid Waste Management (SWM)	1,07,312	14%	17%	13%	
Nuisance due to stray dogs, monkeys, etc.	70,935	2%	2%	2%	
Sewerage/Drainage	33,746	2%	2%	2%	
Pest Control	21,443	0.41%	0.41%	0.48%	
Garden	17,611	6%	7%	7%	
License	17,146	11%	11%	11%	
Roads	11,466	6%	6%	8%	
Fire Safety Related	2,019	0%	0.01%	0%	
Sanitation	1,511	2%	2%	3%	
Pollution	769	0.12%	0.05%	0.19%	
Municipal School Education	172	8%	8%	7%	
Medical Officer Health	177	5%	5%	4%	
Issues Raised not related to the above Civic Complaints		12%	10%	12%	
Others Civic Issues (not related to the manifestos)	13,277	29%	25%	27%	
Total Issues Raised related only to Manifesto Points <sup>1</sup>		32,889	7,310	5,627	
Total Complaint/Issues Raised	5,23,137	46,412	9,690	7,719	

### **Inferences**

- From April 2017 to March 2021, the complaints related to buildings were 2,25,553, however, an average of only 4% of deliberations were raised by BJP, AAP and INC parties in Delhi.
- Delhi faced 70,935 citizen complaints related to the nuisance caused by animals from April 2017 to March 2021, however of the total deliberations, only 2% issues were raised by all party councillors.
- Similarly, 33,746 sewerage complaints were registered from April 2017 to March 2021, however, from the overall proportion of deliberations raised, only 2% was related to this issue.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Total Issues Raised includes only deliberations related to the party manifesto promises.



Table 4: Issue-wise average number of issues raised by 1 councillor from April 2017 to March 2021

The completed to	Number of	B1 JP	AAP	INC
The complaint related to Manifesto	•		55 Councillors	28 Councillors
Buildings	2,25,553	8	8	13
Solid Waste Management (SWM)	1,07,312	36	31	36
Nuisance due to stray dogs, monkeys, etc.	70,935	5	3	6
Sewerage/Drainage	33,746	4	4	4
Pest Control	21,443	1	1	1
Garden	17,611	16	12	18
License	17,146	28	20	30
Roads	11,466	15	11	21
Fire Safety Related	2,019	0	0	0
Sanitation	1,511	5	4	7
Pollution	769	0	0	0
Municipal School Education	172	20	13	20
Medical Officer Health	177	12	8	10
Issues Raised not related to the above Civic Complaint		32	18	33
OOthers Civic Issue Related (not related to the manifesto)	13,277	74	43	75
Total Issues Raised in Manifesto Point <sup>2</sup>		32,889	7,310	5,627
Total Complaint/Issues Raised	5,23,137	46,412	9,690	7,719

**Note:** Figures in "0" do not represent absolute zero or no issues raised per councillors except cell in grey.

#### Inferences

- On average, one BJP councillor raised most issues on SWM (36), followed by licenses (28), and education (20). One BJP councillor raised only 5 issues on sanitation.
- One AAP councillors, on average raised most issues on SWM (31), followed by 20 issues on license and 13 issues on education. Only 4 issues were raised on sanitation & sewerage.
- On average, one INC councillors, raised maximum issues on SWM (36), followed by licenses (30), and roads (21) & education (20). Only 7 issues on sanitation and 4 issues on sewerage.

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 2}$  Total Issues Raised includes only deliberations related to the party manifestos promises.



## V. A case study on major Civic Manifesto points with Deliberations

During elections, all political parties create their manifesto which includes commitments they promise to achieve if elected. Based on these promises, citizens elect their ideal candidate. Now as the MCD elections are near, we have tried to track the status of some manifesto promises made in 2017 with the number of complaints registered. Along with that we have analysed the number of issues raised by councillors for these issues. For this case study, we have taken three civic issues with maximum complaints.

#### A. Toilet Services in Delhi

Table 5: Toilet Services related manifesto points and the status

Party	Manifesto promise	Status <sup>3</sup>	Deliberations <sup>4</sup> (2017-18 to 2020-21)
BJP (182 Councillors)	World-class toilets will be built in all markets and the whole of Delhi. These toilets will have water, electricity and personnel.	<ul> <li>The community toilet seats for women are 17% less than those for men under MCD.</li> <li>16% of all toilets, there was no water connection available while 10% of them had no electricity</li> <li>Total Available Toilet Seats from Slums: Males-18,166; Females-14,616.</li> <li>Required as per SBM Norms for Slums Male-27,838; Females-32,442</li> </ul>	888
AAP (55 Councillors)	More Public toilets to be built in Delhi.		194
INC (28 Councillors)	Existing community toilets to be revamped and new toilet complexes will be built in slums in MCD land.		193

BJP mentioned in their manifesto World-class toilets with adequate water, electricity and personnel in Delhi however, community toilet seats for women are 17% less than those for men under MCD. Furthermore, 16% of all toilets, there was no water connection available while 10% of them had no electricity in 2020. AAP and INC promised in their manifested to increase public toilets & revamp existing community toilets and build new toilet complexes in slums on MCD land. However, in 2020, there was a deficit of 9,672 toilets for males and 17,826 toiles for females as per the norms prescribed in the SBM guidelines.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> As per an RTI Response.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Includes only those issues raised on the complaints relevant to the manifesto.



## **B.** Drainage System

Table 6: Drainage related manifesto points and the status

Party	Manifesto promise	Status⁵	Deliberations <sup>6</sup> (2017-18 to 2020-21)
BJP (182 Councillors)	The drainage system of the entire city will be renovated for reducing waterlogging	<ul> <li>From 2017 to 2020 a total of 34,169 drainage complaints were</li> </ul>	773
AAP (55 Councillors)	Complete cleaning of drains	registered in Delhi  Of which 83% of complaints were on Drainage chokes, blockages & Cleaning and overflowing manholes  While 17% were related to repairs and reconstruction of drain line	218
INC (28 Councillors)	In association with NIUA, preparing a plan for the layout of modern drainage system across all MCD areas		122

All parties promised to improve the drainage system in Delhi. BJP in their manifesto mentioned creating a drainage system of the entire city will be renovated for reducing waterlogging, AAP promised to carry out a complete cleaning of drains and INC promised to prepare a plan for the layout of modern drainage system across all MCD areas. From 2017 to 2020 a total of 34,169 drainage complaints were registered in Delhi. Of which 83% of complaints were on Drainage chokes, blockages & Cleaning and overflowing manholes. While 17% were related to repairs and reconstruction of the drain line.

### C. Solid Waste Management

Table 7: SWM related manifesto points and the status

Party	Manifesto promise	Status	Deliberations (2017-18 to 2020-21)
BJP (182 Councillors)	Delhi will be made debris-free by establishing a Construction and Demolition (C&D) waste plant	<ul> <li>From 2017 to 2020 a total of 5,311 citizen complaints were related to the removal of</li> </ul>	6,466
AAP (55 Councillors)	Landfills to be ended by 2019	<ul> <li>debris.</li> <li>In 2020-21, Disposal of MSW (municipal solid waste) in Landfill Sites was a total of</li> </ul>	1,685
INC (28 Councillors)	All sanitary landfills to be	5,074 TPD (tons per day) from all 3 MCDs.	1,006

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> As per an RTI Response

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Includes only those issues raised on the complaints relevant to the manifesto.



BJP in their manifesto promised a provision to ensure Delhi will be made debris-free by establishing a C and D waste plant, AAP & INC promised to end the usage of landfills in Delhi. However, from 2017 to 2020 a total of 5,311 citizen complaints were related to the removal of debris. Furthermore, in 2020-21, the Disposal of MSW in Landfill Sites was a total of 5,074 TPD from all 3 MCDs. Despite deliberations raised for services mentioned in the manifesto, there is still a need for improvement in the service delivery by Delhi MCD.

As MCD elections are close, in the 'Targets set for 2022-2027' report, we have collected various global and national targets that should be included in the new manifesto. This will allow for better tracking and monitoring of promises both by citizens and future elected representatives and thus ensure targeted interventions are carried out.



## VI. Annexure

## A. All-Party manifesto links from 2017 MCD elections

## 1. <u>Bharatiya Janta Party:</u>

https://praja.org/praja\_docs/praja\_downloads/Bharatiya%20Janta%20Party%20(BJP)%20Delhi %20Municipal%20Corporation%20Manifesto.pdf

## 2. <u>Aam Aadmi Party:</u>

https://praja.org/praja\_docs/praja\_downloads/Aam\_Aadmi\_Party\_(AAP)\_Delhi\_Municipal\_Corporation\_Manifesto.pdf

## 3. <u>Indian National Congress:</u>

https://praja.org/praja\_docs/praja\_downloads/Indian National Congress (INC) Delhi Municipal Corporation Manifesto.pdf